



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

*Bibliotheca Historica Medii Aevi.* Wegweiser durch die Geschichtswerke des europäischen Mittelalters bis 1500. Von AUGUST POTTHAST. Zweite verbesserte und vermehrte Auflage. (Berlin: Weber. 1896. Two vols., pp. cxlvii, 1749.)

SCHOLARS who have been brought up on Potthast find difficulty in understanding how the older men did such excellent work without the guidance he affords. The old edition, in spite of its age, has been the most useful tool which we possessed. When, about two years ago, it became known that Potthast had revised his work and would soon publish a new edition, there was general rejoicing.

In this second edition, except for minor changes, the order and scope of the work remain the same as in the first, *i. e.*, alphabetical lists of general and special collections, of the separate editions of all narrative sources for the period from 375 to 1500, and of the lives, etc., of the saints. Under each source we find the familiar indications of manuscripts, editions, translations and *Erläuterungsschriften*. The appendix gives the lists of sources for the various countries and periods in thirty-two main divisions. In this appendix Potthast has wisely omitted the lists of popes, emperors and bishops which were in the supplementary volume to the old edition. These lists are so easily accessible in other publications that it would have been a work of supererogation to include them here. Although by these omissions and in many other ways space has been economized, the new edition is more than twice as voluminous as the old.

To turn to details, the compiler has included some documentary sources, which can not be classed under any of his headings. As the choice has been purely arbitrary and only a very few are given, it would have been wiser to omit all. No scholar uses this work for guidance to such material. The lists of manuscripts which follow some of the sources have a certain utility, but they are far from complete and do not form a necessary part of the work. The student who needed this information could generally get it more exactly from the different editions and from the *Erläuterungsschriften*. The other details are given in a most satisfactory manner. Although there are omissions, the work as a whole is surprisingly accurate and trustworthy, if we consider the thousands of facts stated. The dates for the authors and for their separate works, the editions and translations, and the *Erläuterungsschriften* are recorded with the most painstaking care. When one remembers that the last are scattered in general histories, periodicals, university dissertations, school programmes, occasional pamphlets, etc., written in different languages, one marvels at the industry of the collector and appreciates the value of the work in this respect. By these lists Potthast furnishes good bibliographies for many subjects—a feature of the work too often ignored by students. The only drawbacks are that these bibliographies are necessarily unannotated, and for the sake of completeness works of no critical value are included.

Mistakes are inevitable in such a work. Yet in indicating them, one feels almost an ingrate. When so much has been done by a single man for the scholars of the whole world, one hesitates to point out faults in details. But the most sincere tribute to the value of the work is to add one's mite towards its perfection. Fortunately two excellent reviews have appeared, which make the task of other reviewers lighter. One of these was by the late Professor Winkelmann in the *Historische Zeitschrift*, Vol. 76; the other, by Vidier in *Le Moyen Age* for April, 1896. Although these are reviews of only the first half of the first volume, some faults which extend through the work are noted and many errors are corrected. It seems strange that, although these appeared some months before the final half-volume was published, Potthast did not enter their corrections in his "Berichtigungen und Nachträge." This is indicative of one of the weaknesses of this compilation. It is the work of one man who has not cared to get the coöperation of other scholars, especially of those in foreign countries. M. Vidier's review, although animated by indefensible harshness, shows how necessary such coöperation was.

In contributing the sheaf which I have gleaned, I omit all errors which I have seen noted in any previous review. Besides these two reviews mentioned above, many others have appeared, contributing in greater or less degree to the perfection of the work.

Of sources, all the works included in Vol. V., Part II., of the *Recueil des Historiens des Croisades* are omitted, although this volume appeared more than a year before the *Bibliotheca* was completed. There is no space to give these with their editions and *Erläuterungsschriften*, but it is well to note that in this volume we have for the first time good editions of Fulco, Gilo and Benedictus de Accoltis. Other omissions are the work of Oliverius von Paderborn in Vol. 202 of the *Bibliothek des literarischen Vereins*, Tübingen, 1894, and the *Predigten des H. Bernhards* in Vol. 203 of the same collection, 1894. The edition of Bernardus monachus Francus in Michel et Wryght, *Relations des Voyages*, is omitted. Some of the entries under "Charta" do not belong in such a work, but if included at all, the entries should be fuller and more exact. Where others of minor importance and of similar character are noted, the omission of Magna Charta is peculiar.

In the *Erläuterungsschriften* Potthast quotes certain general works, such as the *Histoire Littéraire*, Ebert's *Allgemeine Geschichte der Literatur*, Hardy's *Descriptive Catalogue*, etc., for some sources, but not for all which are especially discussed in these works. The choice seems to have been wholly arbitrary. Balzani's *Early Chroniclers of Europe: Italy*, is quoted sometimes, but more frequently in the Italian version. The works by Masson and Gairdner in the same series seem to have been neglected. Among special works omitted are, for:

Bernardus Claraevallensis, Kugler, *Neue Analecten zur Geschichte des zweiten Kreuzzugs*.

Carmen Ambrosii, Monod and Paris in *Revue des Sociétés savantes des Départements*, Ser. V., Vol. VI., and *Revue Historique*, Vol. III.

Chevalier au Cygne and Conquête de Jérusalem, Pigeonneau, *Le Cycle de la Croisade*.

Cinnamus, Kugler, *Neue Analecten*, as above.

Chronica regia Coloniensis, Fischer, *Kreuzzug Friedrich's I.*

Chronique de Godefroid de Bouillon, Kugler in *Historisches Taschenbuch*, Sechste Folge, VI.; Froboese, *Gottfried von Bouillon*, Berlin, 1879; and compare Potthast, p. 533.

Gesta Ludovici, Kugler, *Analecten zur Geschichte des zweiten Kreuzzugs*.

Guilelmus Tyrius, Dodu, *Histoire des Institutions monarchiques dans le Royaume latin de Jérusalem*, 1894, pp. 2-12.

Guillaume de Machaut, P. Paris, *Le Livre du Voirdit de G. de Machaut*, Paris, 1875; G. Paris in *Revue Historique*, Vol. IV., p. 215.

Jacobus de Vitriaco, Crane, *Exempla of Jacques de Vitry*.

Joinville, Müller, *Chips from a German Workshop*, Vol. III.

Ricardus canonicus, Fischer, *Kreuzzug Friedrich's I.*

Stephanus de Borbone, Lecoy de la Marche, *La Chaire française*.

Villehardouin, Pears, *Fall of Constantinople*.

For several of the saints, La Borderie's different works have been neglected. In the translations there are very curious omissions. Potthast gives three German translations of St. Augustine's *Confessions*, but none into any other language, and he names only one commentary. He may have been terrified by the amount of space necessary to make the entries even relatively complete. He does not seem to have known of the various series of the Fathers in English and French translations. We find no translations mentioned under St. Jerome, Sozomen, Theodoret and many others. Eales's translation of the letters of Bernard of Clairvaux is not entered under the *Epistolæ*, and under the saint's name, in Part III., is given as a translation of his entire works. The *Treuga Dei*, entered on page 1071, which does not belong in this work, has been translated in Henderson's *Select Documents*. These are only examples of many translations which have been omitted. Of course, translations are of little value to a scholar and, unless he is engaged in teaching immature students, he may well be pardoned if he is entirely ignorant of their existence. For minor errors, unimportant but troublesome, such as wrong references, misprints, etc., there is no space in this review.

Yet when we have gathered together all the mistakes already noted by reviewers and several hundred more, which may be found, the total result compared with the accurate statements of Potthast will be an extremely small number. His work is, and will remain, the most valuable guide to the period. And here a criticism is permissible on the form of the book. Such a volume must necessarily be revised constantly by each student for the sake of his own work. Additions will be numerous. But the volumes have been published with very small margins and are unfitted for such additions. A generation intervened between the publication of the two editions. Can we hope to have a revision of such a work even as soon in the future? In the meantime the volumes, already large, must be increased in bulk by interleaving in order to be serviceable.

DANA CARLETON MUNRO.